

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Wednesday, the 25<sup>th</sup> February 2015** at 11.00 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

---

**Draft Minutes:-**

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
2. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member

Invitees:

Smt. Medha Gadgil, Member Secretary and Addl. Chief Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Mantralaya being unable to attend the meeting was granted leave of absence.

Dr. A.S. Vyas, Member couldn't remain present. Hence, leave of absence granted.

Shri. N.K. Deshmukh, I.A.S. having additional charge of Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, being unable to attend the meeting due to official work. Leave of absence granted.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1:** **To approve and confirm minutes of Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Tuesday the 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2015 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.**

Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Tuesday 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2015 are confirmed and approved.



**Item No.2(a): To review actions taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2015.**

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2015, the details of the same are as follows:

Meeting of 3 <sup>rd</sup> February 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 22 <sup>nd</sup> January 2015.	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on <b>5/2/2015.</b>
Item No. 2: (a & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2014-15.	The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on <b>5/2/2015.</b>
Item No. 3:	decide on the proposals received for approval of the fee structure for the courses started during AY 2014-15: a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies. b) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/ Institutes.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>5/2/2015.</b>
Item No. 4	To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2014-15.	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of Saraswati Bahuudeshiya Shikshan Sanstha, by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>
ItemNo.4(1)	RANM0241: Saraswati Bahuudeshiya Shikshan Sanstha, Amravati 444 607.	
ItemNo.4(2)	RGNM0160: Saraswati Bahuudeshiya Shikshan Sanstha, Amravati 444 607.	
ItemNo.4(3)	BAMS0020: Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil College of Ayurved, Pimpri, Pune.	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil College of Ayurved,Pimpri,, by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>
ItemNo.4(4)	MBBS004: MVPS Dr. Vasantao Pawar Medical College Hospital & Research, Nashik.	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of MVPS Dr. Vasantao Pawar Medical College Hospital & Research, by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>

Meeting of 3 <sup>rd</sup> February 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
ItemNo.4(5)	RANM0319: Tirumala ANM School of Nursing, Hadgaon, Nanded	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of Tirumala ANM School of Nursing, Hadgaon, by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>
ItemNo.4(6)	BHMS0040: Purushottamdas Bagla Homeiopathic Medical College & Hospital, Chandrapur.	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of Purushottamdas Bagla Homeiopathic Medical College & Hospital by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>
ItemNo.4(7)	BAMS0018: Kisan Dnyanoday Mandal Gudhe's Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Chalisgaon, Jalgaon.	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of Kisan Dnyanoday Mandal Gudhe's Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Chalisgaon, by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>
ItemNo.4(8)	RANM0397: Swami Narayan Nursing Institute, Nashik	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of Swami Narayan Nursing Institute, by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>
ItemNo.4(9)	BSCN0071: Shiva Trust's Supriyadidi Sule College of Nursing, Aurangabad	Decision is conveyed to The Principal of Shiva Trust's Supriyadidi Sule College of Nursing, by a separate letter dated <b>7/2/2015.</b>

The Samiti noted it.



**Item No.2(b): To review disposal of work – present Scenario for Academic Year 2014- 15(Appeals).**

No.	Course	No. of Appeal Received	Put up in Meeting for finalization	No. of appeal finalised in Meeting	Pending Appeal
1.	MD/MS (PG)	1	0	1	0
2.	Medical/MBBS	2	1	1	0
3.	Ayurved	5	5	0	0
4.	Homeopathic	2	2	0	0
5.	B.Sc.Nursing	1	1	0	0
6.	RANM	5	3	2	0
7.	RGNM	4	1	3	0
	Total	<b>20</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>

The Samiti noted it.

**Item No. 3 :** **To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2014-15:**

**Item No. 3(a) :** **To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies have been cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.**

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2013-14 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2013-14 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.



**BDS(PG)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	BDSPG0001	Annasaheb Chudaman Patil Memorial Dental College, Dhule	200000	210000	<b>240000</b>	450000

**RGNM**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	RGNM0226	Shree Gajanan Maharaj College of Nursing, Jawar, Thane	39320 Collected		<b>42560</b>	108257

**Note :** *R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 1 year can be charged.*

**Note:** *The fee approved, for above courses is subject to affiliation/permission from respective Authorities.*

**Item No. 4:** To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2014-15.

**1)RGNM0061: Dagdojirao Patil RGNM Nursing School, Hadgaon, Nanded.**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

The fee approved for the course started during 2014-15 is Rs. 35,000/-. It is challenged. It is pointed out that there is no admission during 2013-14 as permission was not granted. But the students cannot be saddled with the entire cost. Therefore we apportion it. The fee then comes to about Rs. 45,000/-. The college has also given letter dated 25/2/2015 for approving their fee of Rs. 45,000/-. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

**2)RANM0200/: Kalavati Nursing School, Airoli, Navi Mumbai.  
RGNM0050**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This revision relates to 2 courses RANM & RGNM. The fee approved for RANM course for 2014-15 was Rs. 61,000/- and for RGNM Rs. 69,300/-. They are challenged. They are challenged mainly on the ground that salary of the teachers is not taken into consideration correctly. There is some substance in it. The fee can be approved for RGNM course is Rs. 72,600/- and for RANM course is Rs. 61,600/-. The college has also given 2 letters in respect of these 2 grounds for approval of fee of Rs. 72,600/- for RGNM course and Rs. 61,600/- for RANM course. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

**3)RGNM0058: Florence School of Nursing (RGNM), Latur.**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

The fee approved for the course started during 2014-15 was Rs. 45,000/- for RGNM course. It is challenged. There was no admission during 2013-14. The fee approved during 2012-13 was Rs. 60,000/-. He has to apportion the cost. The fee then comes to about Rs. 60,000/-. The Institute has also given a letter dated 25/2/2015 to approve the same. Office to declare it.

**4)RANM0600: Maa Anusaya School of Nursing, Akola**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of RANM course. The fee approved for the course started during 2013-14 is Rs. 45,000/-. It is challenged. The adhoc fee declare during 2013-14 was Rs. 41,150/-. The point raised is regarding intake. There is some substance in it. Whenever question was asked by our CA the standard answer given was there was a mistake on the part of our Institute. But this cannot be accepted. The fee that can be approved at the most can be Rs. 50,000/-. There is a letter dated 25/2/2015 given for approval of the same, but at the same time it is prayed that it may be increased to Rs. 65,000/-. But it is not possible to accept this 2<sup>nd</sup> part. Hence we approve Rs. 50,000/-. Office to declare it.

**5)RGNM 0212: Rajiv Gandhi RGNM School of Nursing, Udgir.**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of RGNM course. The fee declare during 2014-15 is Rs. 42,460/-. It is pointed out that the intake should have been taken as 20 and not 30. There is some substance in it. But the fee then would go up to only Rs.



45,000/-. The college has also given a letter to that effect. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

**6)RGNM0230: Savitribai Phule RGNM Nursing College IUDP Colony,  
Washim**

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of RGNM course. The fee approved for the course started during 2014-15 is Rs. 35,000/-. It is challenged. There was no admission during 2013-14 as permission was not granted. Therefore we have to apportion the blame. The fee then comes to about Rs. 45,000/-. The Institute has also given a letter dated 25/2/2015 to approve Rs. 45,000/-. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

**7)MDMS0001/: K.J. Somaiya Medical College & Research Centre  
MBBS0001 Sion, Mumbai.**

Heard the Institute. The Notices as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This revision is in respect of MBBS and the Post Graduate courses (PG course). The fee declared for MBBS course for 2014-15 is Rs. 7,00,000/- and for Post Graduate course is Rs. 7,75,000/-. It is challenged. The fee declared for MBBS course during 2013-14 was Rs. 6,60,000/- and for Post Graduate course Rs.7,31,000/-. Approval is challenged mainly on the ground that there is no correct consideration of salary and certain other expenses. There is some substance in it. Even adding 10% to last year's fees, it would be Rs. 7,26,000/- for MBBS course and for PG course it would be Rs. 8,04,000/-. The college has also given letter dated 25/2/2015 stating that the fee for MBBS course may be approved at Rs. 7,26,000/- and for Post Graduate course Rs. 8,04,000/-We approve the same. Office to declare it.

**8)RANM0319: Tirumala ANM School of Nurisng, Hadgaon, Nanded**

Heard the Institute.

They pray for withdrawal of this revision. Allowed to withdraw.



**Item No. 5(i): To consider and decide on the letter dated 18/11/2014 and 10/2/2015 received from Dr. Wasudev B. Durge and Dr. PDM Medical College Amravati submitting Affidavits & replies in respect of financial irregularities and manipulations. (Ref: Item No. 5 dated 16/10/2014).**

Infact the subject was discussed to some extent and the reply of the college was called. This was taken with the permission of the chair, but there was no mention made about it in the minutes of the last meeting. The reply is now received. It is a very lengthy reply. This requires detailed consideration. Therefore the subject is adjourned to the next meeting.

**Item No. 5(ii)(a): To consider and decide on letter dated 31/1/2015 received from Padmashree Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Foundation Medical College Ahmednagar informing a fee structure for repeater students of Post Graduation admitted in AY 2011-12 ( Ref. Item No. 4(ii) dated 16/10/2014).**

And

**Item No. 5(ii)(b): To consider and decide on the letter dated 3/2/2015 received from Dr. Sandeep B. Deokate and others regarding fees from repeater PG students in respect of PDVVPF's Medical College.**

There is a resolution passed by the samiti, in view of the earlier letter at Item No. 4(ii) of the meeting dated 16/10/2014. Now the Institute has sent a reply to it. The reply dated 31/1/2015 received on 3/2/2015. It is a vague reply. In addition there is a complaint received from the students in respect of the same MS/MD diploma courses. It is received on 3/2/2015. Office to send the copy of the complaint to the college and call for its reply. After receiving the reply further steps to be taken.

**Item No. 5(iii): To consider and decide on the letter dated 30/1/2015 received from Aromira School of Nursing about wrong name of college.(Ref. Item No. 3(a) dated 27/8/2014).**

Considered the letter dated 30/1/2015 received from the Institute. It is prayed in the said letter to be correct, in the declaration of fee made by this office on 27/8/2014, Item No. 3(a), Page No 15, Sr. No.21, to be read as under:-





## RANM

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fee For the course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
21	RANM0247	Aromira School of Nursing, Bhandara	60280	63294	<b>66000</b>	123747

Office to declare it.

**Item No. 6: Any other matter with the permission of the Chair.**

The office to call for suggestions regarding amending, adding or altering the norms which are already applicable for current year. The suggestions in writing to be submitted on or before 23/3/2015. Those suggestions to be considered at the time of Open Hearing. The suggestions regarding altering the norms to be given with reference to specific norm of 2014-15.

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Wednesday** the **25<sup>th</sup>** of **March 2015** at **11:00 a.m.** in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date: 26-2-15

  
(P.S. PATANKAR)  
CHAIRMAN