

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Tuesday, the 25<sup>th</sup> March 2014** at 11.00 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

**Draft Minutes:-**

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member
2. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
3. Dr. A.S. Vyas : Member

Smt. Manisha Mhaiskar Member Secretary and Chief Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Mantralaya being unable to attend the meeting was granted leave of absence.

Shri P.E. Gaikwad, Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was on Election Duty in Aligad therefore, Mrs. K.V. Sane, Section Officer, was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1(a): To approve and confirm the Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Tuesday, 25<sup>th</sup> February 2014 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.**

The Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Tuesday, the 25<sup>th</sup> February 2014 at 11.00 a.m. at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai - 400 051 are confirmed and approved.

**Item No.2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings including meeting held on Tuesday the 25<sup>th</sup> February 2014.**

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> February 2014, the details of the same are as follows:



Meeting of 25 <sup>th</sup> February 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 25 <sup>th</sup> February 2014.	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on <b>1/3/2014</b> .
Item No. 2: (a & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2013-14.	The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on <b>1/3/2014</b> .
Item No. 3:	<p>To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2013-14:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.</li> <li>b) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies have been cleared by the Colleges/ Institutes.</li> <li>c) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are not cleared by the Colleges/ Institutes.</li> </ol>	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>1/3/2014</b> .
Item No. 4	<p>To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2013-14.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) RGNM0171: Shree Sai Nursing (RGNM) College, Jamkhed, Ahmednagar.</li> <li>2) BAMSPG0007 &amp; BAMSUG0005: Sumitibhai Shah Ayurved College, Hadapsar, Pune.</li> <li>3) RANM0439: Sai Nursing Institute, Babhuleshwar, Ahmednagar.</li> <li>4) RANM0099:MAM's Institute of Nursing Education, Hadpsar, Pune.</li> </ol>	<p>Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website &amp; also put up on the Notice Board on <b>1/3/2014</b>.</p> <p>Decision is conveyed to the colleges by a separate letter dated <b>3/3/2014</b>.</p>
Item No. 5	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) To consider and decide on the email letter dated 13/2/2014 received from Dr. Nitin Sancheti regarding incorrect tuition fees charged by PDVVPF's Medical College, Ahmednagar &amp; also to refund tuition fees of 3 ½ years.</li> </ol>	<p>Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website &amp; also put up on the Notice Board on <b>1/3/2014</b>.</p> <p>Decision is conveyed to the college by a separate letter dated <b>3/3/2014</b>.</p>
Item No. 6	Any other matter with the permission of the Chair.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & also put up on the Notice



Meeting of 25 <sup>th</sup> February 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
2.	Considered the letter dated 24/2/2014 received from Maratha Vidya Prasarak Samaj's Institute of Nursing Education, Nashik.	Board on 1/3/2014.  Decision is conveyed to the Maratha Vidya Prasarak Samaj's Institute of Nursing Education Nashik by a separate letter dated 3/3/2014.

Samiti noted it.

**Item No. 2(b): To review disposal of work – Present Scenario for Academic Year 2013-14.**

i) Chart showing No. of fees approval proposals received from the Institutes of Health Science Courses/Institutes for Academic Year 2013-14.

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2012-13)	Online Proposal Confirmed	No.of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared ( A.Y. 2013-14)	HOLD	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			No. of Colleges who failed to submit proposals	Ad-hoc Fees (A.Y. 2013-14)
								Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.		
1	MD/MS (PG)	12	9	10	10	0	0	0	0	0	2	520930/-
2	Medical/MBBS	13	13	12	12		0	0		0	1	353900/-
3	PG Dental	15	14	13	13		0	0	0	0	2	185220/-
4	BDS	22	19	19	19		0	0		0	3	159260/-
5	PG-Ayurved	12	10	10	8	2	0	0	0	0	2	104180/-
6	Ayurved	40	38	38	20	18	0	0	0	0	2	82580/-
7	PG. Homeopathic	14	11	12	12		0	0		0	2	69460/-
8	Homeopathic	45	42	42	42		0	0		0	3	47190/-
9	Physiotherapy	21	19	17	17		0	0		0	4	49540/-
10	MP-TH (PG.- Physiothera	8	3	5	5		0	0	0	0	3	63670/-

No.	Streams	No. Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2012-13)	Online Proposal Confirmed	No.of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2013-14)	HOLD	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Ad-hoc Fees (A.Y. 2013-14)
								Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.	
	py)										
11	Occupational Therapy	2	0	0			0	0		2	41290/-
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	1	0	0			0			1	57880/-
13	PG - Unani	4	1	1			1	1		3	57880/-
14	Unani	6	2	2	2		0		0	4	49540/-
15	BASLP	2	0	0			0			2	53080/-
16	M.Sc.Nursing	10	10	9	9		0		0	1	57880/-
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	22	22	22	22		0	0	0	0	53080/-
18	B.Sc.Nursing	52	54	52	51		1	1	0	0	47190/-
20	DMLT(After B.Sc.)	1	0	0			0			1	50000/-
21	RANM Nursing	430	400	408	395		13	3	7	3	39320/-
22	RGNM Nursing	170	170	164	161		3	0	3	0	39320/-
23	Dental Hygienist							0			16850/-
24	Dental Mechanic							0			16850/-
	<b>Total</b>	<b>902</b>	<b>837</b>	<b>836</b>	<b>798</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>66</b>

Samiti noted it.

- i) Pendency of Revision Applications for the month ending February 2014 for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
1	MD/MS (PG)	2	2	0
2	Medical/MBBS	4	4	0
3	PG Dental	0	0	0

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendancy
4	BDS	0	0	0
5	PG- Ayurved	2	1	1
6	Ayurved	4	2	2
7	PG. Homeopathic	0	0	0
8	Homeopathic	2	1	1
9	Physiotherapy	0	0	0
10	MP-TH (PG.- Phisiotherapy)	0	0	0
11	Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
13	PG - Unani	0	0	0
14	Unani	0	0	0
15	BASLP	0	0	0
16	M.Sc.Nursing	0	0	0
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	0	0	0
18	B.Sc.Nursing	0	0	0
19	RANM Nursing	10	7	3
20	RGNM Nursing	5	3	2
21	Dental Hygienist	0	0	0
22	Dental Mechanic	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>		<b>29</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>9</b>

Samiti noted it.

**Item No. 3:** **To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2013-14:**

**Item No. 3(a) :** **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**



The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2013-14 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2013-14 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

**RANM**

Sr. No.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for Course Starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for Course Starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	RANM0107	Anuradha Nursing School, Chikli, Buldhana	40070	<b>45000</b>	56477
2	RANM0155	Bhartiya Mahila Vikas Nursing Training School, Wardha		<b>40000</b>	80000
3	RANM0587	Painganga Institute of Nursing Buldhana		<b>55000</b>	107163

**Item No. 4 :** **To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for approval of fees for AY 2013-14 :-**

**Item No. 4(1):** **BAMSPG0001 – Annasaheb Dange Ayurved College, A/P- Ashta, Tal- Walwa, Dist-Sanqli- 416301.**

Heard the Institute. The Institute has given the Notice to the students/parents as per our resolution. But none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of P.G course in Ayurved. The fee approved for 2013-14 was Rs. 1,75,000/-. It is challenged. The fee approved for 2012-13 was Rs. 2,00,000/-. Only 1 point is raised. It is pointed out that the sanctioned strength was increased. But for that the Institute was required to pay amount of Rs. 10,50,000/- and proposal fee of Rs.



2,00,000/- (non-refundable fee) paid to the Government . It was not taken into consideration. If it is taken into consideration, fee exceed to some extent of Rs. 2,00,000/-. But the college has given letter dated 25/3/2013 stating that the fee at Rs. 2,00,000/- be approved. It is reasonable. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

**Item No. 4(2):** **BAMS0010- Annasaheb Dange Ayurved College, A/P- Ashta, Tal-Walwa, Dist-Sangli- 416301.**

Heard the Institute.

It is prayed that revision may be allowed to be withdraw. Allowed to withdraw.

**Item No. 4(3):** **RANM & RGNM0153-Sushrusha Nursing School Sahakar Chowk, Daund, Pune 413801.**

Heard the Institute.

It is prayed that Institute may be allowed to withdraw the revision. The expenses are stated to have been made this year during 2013-14 and it will be reflected in the audited account in the next year. Allowed to withdraw.

**Item No. 4(4):** **BAMS0027- Jupiter Ayurvedic Medical College, Shankarpur, Tah & Dist- Nagpur.**

Heard the Institute. The Institute has given the Notice to the students/parents as per our resolution. But none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of the course started during 2013-14. The fee approved was Rs. 85,000/-. The fee demanded was Rs. 1, 35,000/-.

Mainly 2 points are raised i.e. Rent paid to the trust was not considered. But as per our norms such rent is not permissible. What is permissible is usage charges. We grant the same. The 2<sup>nd</sup> point raised in respect of divisor factor. It is stated that it should be 160 and not 180 considering the fact that there were no admissions for 2<sup>nd</sup> years due to non granting of permission by Ayush . We accept the same. If considered, the fee comes to Rs. 95,000/-. A letter is given by the Institute dated 25/3/2014 stating that the fee may be approved at about Rs. 1,00,000/-. We approve the fee of Rs. 95,000/-. Office to declare it.

**Item No. 5(a):** **To consider and decide on the Affidavit dated 10/3/2014 received from Dr. Nitin Sancheti regarding incorrect tuition fees charged by PDVVPF's Medical College, Ahmednagar & also to refund tuition fees of 3 1/2 years. (Ref: Item No. 5 of minutes 25/2/2014).**

Notice to be given to the Institute i.e. PDVVPF's Medical College, Ahmednagar calling for explanation within 4 weeks. Office also to send copy of this complaint of Mr. Nitish Nitin Sancheti dated 6/3/2014. Office to place this after receipt of explanation.



**Item No. 5(b):** **To consider the complaint letter dated 25/2/2014 along with affidavit & 16/1/2014 received from the Student's of YMT Dental College (1<sup>st</sup> year winter batch 2013) regarding extra tuition fees demanded by the college depending on the number of subjects failed.**

The Samiti had earlier received similar complaint, but it was not affirmed. Therefore another complaint dated 25/2/2013 is made. The Samiti is informed that already explanation is called from the Institute. After receipt of the information to be placed before the Samiti for consideration.

**Item No. 5(c):** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 21/2/2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Satara submitting the compliance in the matter of Shri. S.C. Sahoo. (Ref: Item No. 5(d) of minutes 3/1/2014).**

In view of the complaint received from Mr. S.C. Saho in respect of Institute of Medical Sciences & Research , Satara in which his daughter Ms. Prinyaka Sahoo is studying MBBS course, explanation was called from the Institute . The Institute has sent a reply dated 21/2/2014. It has denied the allegation that there is no sufficient infrastructure in the college. It is stated that there is requisite infrastructure and the course is approved by Medical Council of India. The Institute has also denied that any amount was demanded as a security deposit and Mr. S.C. Sahoo has not paid any such amount as security deposit for his daughter. Along with the complaint there is no document annexed to indicate such payment. Therefore complaint is rejected.

**Item No. 5(d):** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 16/1/2014 received from Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College & Hospital & Research Center (UG/PG) Nashik requesting to consider their revision of appeal for fixation of fee structure for the AY 2013-14.**

Considered the letter dated 16/1/2014 received from the Institute. The revision filed by the said institute was rejected by the Samiti as it was not received within limitation as provided by our norms. The fee was declared on 6/8/2013. The Institute has applied on 11/9/2013 for calculation sheet. It became available to the Institute on 22/10/2013 on website. The Revision came to be filed on 9/11/2013. Considering these dates this revision was in time . Office to proceed with the same.

**Item No. 5(e):** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 10/3/2014 received from Somaiya Ayurvihar K.J. Somaiya Medical Trust requesting to consider their revision of appeal for fixation of fees for AY 2013-14.**

Considered the letter dated 10/3/2014 received from the Institute. The Samiti had earlier rejected this revision on the ground that it was beyond limitation as per the norms of the Samiti. The Institute has given no explanation for such delay. Therefore it is not possible to entertain it . Hence rejected. Office to communicate.



**Item No. 6: Any other matter with the permission to the Chair.**

Resolution passed by the Higher Technical Department bearing No. स्वअवि २०१३/(२१८/२०१३)/विशि-४ dated 13/2/2014 states that for Non- Official members and invitee member of the screening committee, they shall be paid Honorarium of Rs. 5,000/- . It is mentioned in serial No 1(1) In serial No. 1(2) is about grant of Travelling Allowance. The Samiti resolves that the said Resolution be made applicable to this Samiti members and be paid accordingly. Office to inform the Government.

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Tuesday the 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2014 at 11.00 a.m.** in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, 3<sup>rd</sup> floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date: 27-3-14

  
(P.S. PATANKAR)  
CHAIRMAN