

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Tuesday , the 3rd February 2015** at 11.00 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

Draft Minutes:-

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
2. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member
3. Dr. A.S. Vyas : Member

Invitees:

Smt. Medha Gadgil, Member Secretary and Addl. Chief Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Mantralaya being unable to attend the meeting was granted leave of absence.

Shri. N.K. Deshmukh, I.A.S. having additional charge of Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, was present in the meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm minutes of Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Thursday the 22nd January 2015 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Thursday 22nd January 2015 are confirmed and approved.



Item No.2(a): To review actions taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meeting held on 22nd January 2015.

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on 22nd January 2015, the details of the same are as follows:

Meeting of 22 nd January 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 22 nd January 2015.	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on 23/1/2015 . The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on 23/1/2015 .
Item No. 2: (a & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2014-15.	
Item No. 3:	To decide on the proposals received for approval of the fee structure for the courses started during AY 2014-15: a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies. b) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out and cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & also put up on the Notice Board on 23/1/2015 .
Item No. 4	To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2014-15.	Decision is conveyed to the Principal of Motiwala Homeopathic Medical College by a separate letter dated 28/1/2015
Item No. 4(1)	BHMS0020: Motiwala Homeopathic Medical College, Nashik	
Item No. 4(2)	BAMS0026: Mahadeorao Shivankar Ayurved Medical College, Kudwa, Gondiya.	
Item No. 4(3)	MDMS0001/: K.J.Somaiya Medical College & MBBS0001 Research Centre.	
Item No. 4(4)	BAMS0027:Jupiter Ayurvedic Medical College, Khamia Road, Nagpur.	Decision is conveyed to the Principal of Jupiter Ayurvedic Medical College, by a separate letter dated 28/1/2015

Meeting of 22 nd January 2015		Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 4(5)		BAMS0016:Dada Saheb Surupsingh Naik Ayurvedic College, Nagaon Dhule.	Decision is conveyed to the Principal of Dada Saheb Surupsingh Naik Ayurvedic College, by a separate letter dated 28/1/2015
Item No. 5(i)		To Consider and decide on the Affidavit dated 10/3/2014 received from Dr. Nitin Sancheti regarding incorrect tuition fees charged by PDVVPF's Medical College, Ahmednagar & also refund of tuition fees of 3 ½ years. (Ref: Item No. 4(i) of minutes 22/12/2014).	Decision is conveyed to the Principal of PDVVPF's Medical College and Dr. Nitin Sancheti, by a separate letter dated 28/1/2015
Item No. 5(ii)		To consider and decide on letter dated 19/12/2014 received from Padmashree Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Foundation's Institute of Nursing Education replies in furtherance of a Ref. Item No. 4(i) of minutes 1/12/2014.	Decision is conveyed to the Principal of PDVVPF's Medical College by a separate letter dated 28/1/2015
Item No. 5(iii)		To consider and decide on letter dated 18/12/2014 received from KDA Nursing College regarding fees structure for Basic B.Sc. Nursing also as only for Post Basic B.Sc. Nursing fees is declared for the AY 2014-15.	Decision is conveyed to the Principal of KDA Nursing College by a separate letter dated 28/1/2015

The Samiti noted it.

Item No.2(b): To review disposal of work – present Scenario for Academic Year 2014- 15.

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2013-14)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 15 September 14	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2014-15)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Adhoc Fees (A.Y. 2014-15)
							Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.	
1	MD/MS (PG)	12	11	12	12	0	0		0	Rs.557390/

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2013-14)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 15 September 14	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2014-15)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Adhoc Fees (A.Y. 2014-15)
							Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.	
2	Medical/MBBS	13	14	14	14	0	0		0	Rs.371590/
3	PG Dental	18	12	11	11	0	0	0	0	Rs.198180/
4	BDS	25	20	20	20	0	0	0	0	Rs.167220/
5	PG- Ayurved	14	10	11	11	0	0	0	0	Rs.111470/
6	Ayurved	44	38	38	38	0	0	0	0	Rs.86710/-
7	PG. Homeopathic	14	10	11	11	0	0		0	Rs.74320/-
8	Homeopathic	45	42	42	42	0	0		0	Rs.49550/-
9	Physiotherapy	22	19	19	19	0	0	0	0	Rs.52020/-
10	MP-TH (PG.- Physiotherapy)	22	2	6	6	0	0	0	0	Rs.68130/-
11	Occupational Therapy	2	0	0		0	0			Rs.43350/-
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	1	0	0		0	0			Rs.61930/-
13	PG - Unani	4	1	1	1	0	0		0	Rs.61930/-
14	Unani	6	3	3	2	1	0	1	0	Rs.52020/-
15	BASLP	2	0	0		0	0			Rs.55730/-
16	M.Sc.Nursing	13	11	11	11	0	0	0		Rs.61930/-
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	27	28	24	24	0	0	0	0	Rs.55730/-
18	B.Sc.Nursing	52	61	58	58	0	0		1	Rs.49550/-
19	DMLT(After B.Sc.)	1	0	0		0	0			Rs.52500/-

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2013-14)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 15 September 14	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2014-15)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			Adhoc Fees (A.Y. 2014-15)
							Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.	
20	RANM Nursing	605	408	408	407	1	0	0	1	Rs.41290/-
21	RGNM Nursing	220	175	168	167	1	0	0	1	Rs.41290/-
22	Dental Hygienist						0			Rs.17690/-
23	Dental Mechanic						0			Rs.17690/-
	Total	1162	865	857	854	3	0	1	2	

The Samiti noted it.

Board of Hearing of review applications against final fee structures declared for A.Y. 2014-15 (Medical Education)

No.	Course	No. of Appeal Received	Put up in Meeting for finalization	No. of appeal finalised in Meeting	Pending Appeal
1.	MD/MS (PG)	1	0	0	1
2.	Medical/MBBS	2	1	1	1
3.	PG Dental	0	0	0	0
4.	BDS	0	0	0	0
5.	PG- Ayurved	0	0	0	0
6.	Ayurved	5	3	3	2
7.	PG. Homeopathic	0	0	0	0
8.	Homeopathic	2	1	1	1
9.	Physiotherapy	0	0	0	0
10.	PG.-Physiotherapy	0	0	0	0
11.	Occupational Therapy	0	0	0	0
12.	P.G.Occupational Therapy	0	0	0	0
13	PG - Unani	0	0	0	0
14	Unani	0	0	0	0
15	BASLP	0	0	0	0

A

16	M.Sc.Nursing	0	0	0	0
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	0	0	0	0
18	B.Sc.Nursing	1	1	0	1
19	DMLT	0	0	0	0
20	RANM	5	0	0	5
21	RGNM Nursing	4	0	0	4
	Total	20	5	5	15

The Samiti noted it.

Item No. 3 : To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2014-15:

Item No. 3(a) : To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.

Nil

Item No. 3(b): To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/ Institutes.

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2013-14 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2013-14 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2nd year, 3rd year and 4th year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

RANM

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	RANM0349	Dr. Zakir Hussain Education Society's Marathada Nursing School, Nanded	60000	63000	63000	84150

RGNM

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Interim Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2014-15	Institute Demands
1	RGNM0152	Dr. Zakir Hussain Education Society's Marathada Nursing School, Nanded	64400	67620	64400	-

Note : *R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 1 year can be charged.*

Note: *The fee approved, for above courses is subject to affiliation/permission from respective Authorities.*

Note: **Additional fee to be collected from all students of the course except those admitted in the year 2014-15.*

Item No. 4: To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2014-15.

1)RANM0241: Saraswati Bahuudeshiya Shikshan Sanstha, Amravati 444 607.

And

2)RGNM0160: Saraswati Institute of Nursing Sciences and Research, Amravati.

Both these revisions are dated 5/1/2014 and filed against approval of fees for 2 courses 1)RANM & 2) RGNM. There is a letter written by the institute dated 13/1/2015 for permitting them to withdraw those revisions. Allowed to withdraw .

3)BAMS0020: Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil College of Ayurved, Pimpri, Pune.

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

The fee approved for the course started during 2014-15 was Rs. 1,32,470/-. It is challenged . The fee approved for 2011-12 was Rs. 1,50,000/-. The Ayush did not grant permission to the institute to admit students in 2012-13, 2013-14. The point raised is related to Divisor factor on our part. But some blame for not getting permission from Ayush also lies with the institute. The Institute

has now given a letter that atleast fee of Rs. 1,50,000/- may be approved. We feel it is reasonable. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

4)MBBS0004: MVPS Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College Hospital & Research, Nashik

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

The fee approved for course started during 2014-15 is Rs. 4,10,000/-. It is challenged. The fee approved for the course started during 2013-14 was Rs. 3,70,000/-. The fee originally demanded is Rs. 4,45,000/-. The main point raised is relating to not granting hospital deficit of 50%. It is pointed out that hospital is for six years only. Therefore as per our norms 50% deficit is to be granted . There is substance in it. The Institute has now given letter dated 3/2/2015 stating that their fee may be approved at Rs. 4,25,000/-. It is reasonable. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

5)RANM0319: Tirumala ANM School of Nursing, Hadgaon, Nanded

Adjourned for technical difficulty. To come up in due course for hearing.

6)BHMS0040: Purushottamdas Bagla Homeopathic Medical College & Hospital, Chandrapur.

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

The fee approved for the course started during 2014-15 is Rs. 46,200/-. It is challenged. The fee approved for the course started during 2013-14 was Rs. 43,790/-. The point raised is relating to not considering properly usage charges. But it is admitted that there was error in not mentioning the usage charges . It is prayed that the same may be considered atleast to some extent. They have now given letter dated 3/2/2015 stating that the fee may be approved at Rs. 48,000/-. It is reasonable. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

7)BAMS0018: Kisan Dnyanoday Mandal Gudhe's Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Chalisgaon, Jalgaon.

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

The fee demanded for the course started during 2014-15 is Rs. 78,350/-. It is challenged. It is pointed out that there were no admissions during 2012-13 and 2013-14, due to the order passed by Ayush. Therefore the divisor factor should have been considered taking into consideration that aspect. But it admitted that they were responsible partly for such order of Ayush. The fee approved for 2011-12 is Rs. 1,07,000/-. They have stated that atleast Rs. 1,07,000/- may be granted. The letter dated 3/2/2015 is also given to that effect. Considering that it is a BAMS course, we approve the same. Office to declare it.



8)RANM0397: Swami Narayan Nursing Institute, Nashik

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of RANM course. The fee approved for the course started during 2014-15 is Rs. 45,000/-. It is challenged . It is pointed out that the fee approved for 2013-14 was Rs. 50,000/-. The Institute has failed to mention the same in the proposal. It is prayed that atleast the same may be continued as it is required to run the college. A letter dated 3/2/2015 is given to that effect. We approve the same. Office to declare it.

9)BSCN0071: Shiva Trust's Supriyadidi Sule College of Nursing, Aurangabad.

Heard the Institute. The Notice as per our resolution was given, but none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

It is in respect of BSCN course. The fee approved for the course started during 2014-15 is Rs. 48,060/-. It is challenged. It is challenged on the ground that the salary has not been correctly taken into consideration. It is pointed out that it first 2 month salary was paid through the trust fund. It is required to be considered. There is some substance in it. The institute has now given letter dated 3/2/2015 that their fee may be approved at Rs. 50,000/-. We approve the same . Office to declare it.

Item No. 5: Any other matter with the permission of the Chair.

Nil

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Wednesday** the **25th** of **February 2015** at **11:00 a.m.** in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date:

5-2-15


(R.S. PATANKAR)
CHAIRMAN