

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Wednesday, the 5<sup>th</sup> February 2014** at 11.00 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

**Draft Minutes:-**

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
2. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member
3. Dr. A.S. Vyas : Member

Invitees:

- 1) Dr. P.H. Shingare : I/c Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State

Shri Anand B. Kulkarni Member Secretary and Addl. Chief Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Mantralaya being unable to attend the meeting was granted leave of absence.

Shri P.E. Gaikwad, Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti was present in the meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1(a): To confirm and approve the Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday the 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2014 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.**

The Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 3<sup>rd</sup> Januray 2014 at 11.00 a.m. at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 305, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai - 400 051 are confirmed and approved.



**Item No.2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings including meeting held on Friday the 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2014.**

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2014, the details of the same are as follows:

<b>Meeting of 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2014</b>	<b>Actionable Points</b>	<b>Action Taken by Office</b>
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 3 <sup>rd</sup> January 2014.	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on <b>4/1/2014</b> .
Item No. 2: (a & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2013-14.	The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on <b>6/1/2014</b> .
Item No. 3:	To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2013-14: a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies. b) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies have been cleared by the Colleges/ Institutes. c) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are not cleared by the Colleges/ Institutes.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on <b>4/1/2014</b> & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>6/1/2014</b> .  Decision is conveyed to the colleges by a separate letter dated <b>7/1/2014</b> .
Item No. 4	To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2013-14. 1) MBBS0010: Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College, Narhe, Pune. 2) BHMS0013: Dr. J.J. Magdum Homoeopathic Medical College, Jaysingpur, Kolhapur. 3) RANM0329: G.S. Nursing School, Sakoli, Bhandara.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on <b>4/1/2014</b> & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>6/1/2014</b> .  Decision is conveyed to the colleges by a separate letter dated <b>7/1/2014</b> .
Item No. 5	a) To consider and decide on the letter dated 19/11/2013 received from Sant Gajanan Maharaj School of Nursing in respect of consideration of fee approval of RGNM Course. (Ref. Agenda Item No. 3 (a) meeting dated 17/09/2013). b) To consider and decide on the letter dated 22/11/2013 received from Seva Nursing School asking for separate	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on <b>4/1/2014</b> & also put up on the Notice Board on <b>6/1/2014</b> .

Meeting of 3 <sup>rd</sup> January 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
	<p>consideration of fee approval of RGNM Course as the proposal was submitted for i.e. RANM &amp; RGNM both the courses (Ref. Agenda Item No. 3 (a) meeting dated 15/10/2013).</p> <p>c) To consider and decide on the letter dated 9/12/2013 received from GSK School of Nursing (RANM) requesting to allow submission of proposals for approval of fees for the Academic Year 2013-14 (Ref. Agenda Item No.5(a) meeting dated 4/12/2013).</p> <p>d) To consider and decide on the letter dated 13/12/2013 received from Mr. Sahoo in respect of compliance of decision taken in the meeting dated 8/11/2013 (Ref. Agenda Item No. 5 (ii) in the meeting dated 8/11/2013.</p>	<p>Decision is conveyed to the college by a separate letter dated <b>7/1/2014</b>.</p> <p>Decision is conveyed to Mr.Sahoo by a separate letter dated <b>7/1/2014</b>.</p>
Item No. 6	<p>a) To consider and decide on the letter dated 26/11/2013 received from Saraswati Dhanwantari Dental College &amp; Hospital Post Graduate &amp; Research Institute asking permission to charge fees from the repeater students of UG &amp; PG course.</p> <p>b) To consider and decide on the letter dated 4/12/2013 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of representation cum complaints from some students of Dadasaheb Swaroopsingh Naik Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Nagaon, Dhule demanding exorbitant college fees &amp; other fees.</p> <p>c) To consider and decide on letter dated 11/12/2013 received from Director of Medical Education Research, Mumbai in respect of fixation of fees for repeater students of Dadasaheb Surupsingh Nayik Ayurved University, Dhule.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website on <b>4/1/2014</b> &amp; also put up on the Notice Board on <b>6/1/2014</b>.</p> <p>Decision is conveyed to the colleges by a separate letter dated <b>7/1/2014</b>.</p>

Samiti noted it.



**Item No. 2(b): To review disposal of work – Present Scenario for Academic Year 2013-14.**

i) Chart showing No. of fees approval proposals received from the Institutes of Health Science Courses/Institutes for Academic Year 2013-14.

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2012-13)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 29 June 13	No.of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2013-14)	Hold	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			No. of Colleges who failed to submit proposals	Ad-hoc Fees (A.Y. 2013-14)
								Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.		
1	MD/MS (PG)	12	9	10	10	0	0	0		0	2	520930/
2	Medical/MB BS	13	13	12	12		0	0		0	1	353900/
3	PG Dental	15	14	13	13		0	0	0	0	2	185220/
4	BDS	22	19	18	18		0	0		0	4	159260/
5	PG-Ayurved	12	10	10	8	2	0	0	0	0	2	104180/
6	Ayurved	40	38	38	20	18	0	0	0	0	2	82580/-
7	PG. Homeopathic	14	11	12	12		0	0		0	2	69460/-
8	Homeopathic	45	42	42	42		0	0		0	3	47190/-
9	Physiotherapy	21	19	17	17		0	0		0	4	49540/-
10	MP-TH (PG.- Physiotherapy)	8	3	5	5		0	0	0	0	3	63670/-
11	Occupational Therapy	2	0	0			0	0			2	41290/-
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	1	0	0			0	0			1	57880/-
13	PG - Unani	4	1	1			1	1			3	57880/-
14	Unani	6	2	2	2		0	0		0	4	49540/-
15	BASLP	2	0	0			0	0			2	53080/-
16	M.Sc.Nursing	10	10	9	9		0	0		0	1	57880/-
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	22	22	22	19		0	0	0	0	0	53080/-
18	B.Sc.Nursing	52	54	52	49		3	2	0	1	0	47190/-

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2012-13)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 29 June 13	No.of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared ( A.Y. 2013-14)	Hold	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			No. of Colleges who failed to submit proposals	Ad-hoc Fees (A.Y. 2013-14)
								Under Scrutinized	Deff.	Verified by C.A.		
20	DMLT(After B.Sc.)	1	0	0			0	0			1	50000/-
21	RANM Nursing	430	400	408	387		21	10	7	4	22	39320/-
22	RGNM Nursing	170	170	164	160		4	0	4	0	6	39320/-
23	Dental Hygienist							0				16850/-
24	Dental Mechanic							0				16850/-
	<b>Total</b>	<b>902</b>	<b>837</b>	<b>835</b>	<b>786</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>67</b>	

Samiti noted it.

- i) Pendency of Revision Applications for the month ending December 2013 for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
1	MD/MS (PG)	2	1	1
2	Medical/MBBS	4	2	2
3	PG Dental	0	0	0
4	BDS	0	0	0
5	PG- Ayurved	2	0	2
6	Ayurved	2	0	2
7	PG. Homeopathic	0	0	0
8	Homeopathic	1	1	0
9	Physiotherapy	0	0	0
10	MP-TH (PG.- Phisiotherapy)	0	0	0

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
11	Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
13	PG - Unani	0	0	0
14	Unani	0	0	0
15	BASLP	0	0	0
16	M.Sc.Nursing	0	0	0
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	0	0	0
18	B.Sc.Nursing	0	0	0
19	RANM Nursing	7	2	5
20	RGNM Nursing	4	1	3
21	Dental Hygienist	0	0	0
22	Dental Mechanic	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>		<b>22</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>15</b>

Samiti noted it.

**Item No. 3:** **To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2013-14:**

**Item No. 3(a) :** **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2013-14 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2013-14 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.



And

**Item No. 3(b) : To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies have been cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.**

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2013-14 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2013-14 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

**RANM**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	RANM0294	Devyani School of Nursing, Yavatmal	40000	<b>40000</b>	60000
2	RANM0431	Kiran Nursing School, Dhule	60000	<b>65000</b>	75000
3	RANM0431	GSK School of Nursing , Beed	60000	<b>50000</b>	73345
4	RANM0524	Omkar Nursing School, Biloli, Nanded	50000	<b>48000</b>	67708

**BSCN & MSCN**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute		Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	BSCN0022	Bombay Hospital College of Nursing, Mumbai	BSCN	75000	<b>75000</b>	75000
			MSCN	80000	<b>80000</b>	80000

**Note:** *R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 3 years can be charged.*

**Item No. 3(c):** To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are not cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.

Nil.

**Item No. 4 :** To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for approval of fees for AY 2013-14 :-

**Item No. 4(1):** RANM0416 & RGNM0174 – Vijay Ganga Rural Medical Foundation & Research Centre ANM School, Bhalawani, Ahmednagar

None is present on behalf of the Institution. Notice was given to the Institution dated 6/1/2014 and also it was put on the website . Hence the revision is rejected.

**Item No. 4(2):** RANM0504– Swa. Bhau Daji Patil Deshmukh Gramin Vikas Prathisthan RGNM Nursing School, Kotul, Ahmednagar.

Heard the Institute. The Institute has given the Notice to the students/parents as per our resolution. But none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of RANM course. The fee approved for 2012-13 was Rs. 59,000/-. The fee approved for 2013-14 is Rs. 60,000/-. It is pointed out the usage charges were not claimed and hence they were not granted by the Samiti. There seems to be some error on both sides. The Institution has now given letter dated



5/2/2014 stating that their fee may be approved at Rs. 62,000/-. It is reasonable. We approve the same.

**Item No. 4(3): RGNM0152- Swa. Bhau Daji Patil Deshmukh Gramin Vikas Prathisthan RGNM Nursing School, Kotul, Ahmednagar.**

Heard the Institute. The Institute has given the Notice to the students/parents as per our resolution. But none is present on behalf of the students/parents.

This is in respect of RGNM course. The fee approved for 2012-13 was Rs. 59,000/-. The fee approved for 2013-14 is Rs. 60,000/-. It is pointed out the usage charges were not claimed and hence they were not granted by the Samiti. There seems to be some error on both sides. The Institution has now given letter dated 5/2/2014 stating that their fee may be approved at Rs. 62,000/-. It is reasonable. We approve the same.

**Item No. 4(4): BAMS0026- Mahadeorao Shivankar Ayurved Medical College, Kudwa, Gondiya.**

None is present on behalf of the Institution. Notice was given to the Institution dated 6/1/2014 and also it was put on the website . Hence the revision is rejected.

**Item No. 5(a): To consider and decide on the letter dated 31/12/2013 received from Muktai Vidya Pratishthan's Torja Nursing School requesting to consider proposal for fees approval for RANM course for the academic year 2013-14.**

Considered the letter of the Institute received on 1/1/2014. The High Court Order dated 15/7/2013 passed in the Writ Petition 5646 of 2013 restrained the Institution from admitting the students as the necessary permission from the Nursing Council was not obtained. It was obtained by the Institution but required to be amended subsequently by the Indian Nursing Council and the error was corrected in mentioning the year of permission. In view thereof the High Court by order dated 19/12/2013 and permitted the Institution to function. The Institution is allowed to submit the proposal in view of this. Office to inform .

**Item No. 5(b): To consider and decide on the letter dated 12/12/2013 received from Dadasaheb Swaroopsingh Naik Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Nagaon, Dhule asking for an explanatory guidance in respect of fees to be paid by repeater students.**

In respect of this vary college same subject was considered in the earlier meeting dated 3/1/2014 at Item Number 6 (c). It is confirmed today. It applies here College to see the website.

**Item No. 6(a): To consider and decide on the letter dated 6/1/2014 received from Dhanshri Institute of Nursing, Modnimb asking for clarification in respect of fees of RANM course for Academic Year 2011-12 & 2012-13.**

And



**Item No.6(b):** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 6/1/2014 received from Suyash Institute of Nursing, Bairagwadi asking for clarification in respect of fees of RANM course for Academic Year 2011-12 & 2012-13.**

It is in respect of RANM course. It was started in 2011-12. The adhoc fee of 2011-12 was Rs. 35,000/-. In 2012-13, the fee declared was Rs. 60,000/-. The course is of 1 ½ years. Therefore the Institution can charge Rs. 30,000/- for the 6 months period. The letter is correct. Office to inform.

**Item No. 6(c) :** **To consider and decide on the email letter dated 14/11/2013 received from Yash Institute Of Nursing Yavatmal asking for corrections to the declaration of final ANM fees (Sr. No. in the list is 260) for Academic Year 2012-13 .**

The email received dated 14/11/2013 from the institution is considered. The fee approved for 2012-13 was for 1 ½ years full course of RANM. The institution cannot recover anything more than that for the entire course. Office to Communicate.

**Item No. 7:** **Any other matter with the permission to the Chair.**

Nil

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Tuesday the 25<sup>th</sup> February 2014 at 11.30 a.m.** in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, 3<sup>rd</sup> floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date:

5-2-14

  
**(P.S. PATANKAR)**  
**CHAIRMAN**