

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Thursday, the 7th February 2013** at 11.00 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

Draft Minutes:-

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
2. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member
3. Dr. A.S. Vyas : Member

Invitees:

Shri I. S. Chahal, Member Secretary and Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Govt. of Maharashtra. Hence, leave of absence granted.

Shri P.E. Gaikwad, Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti was present in the meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

Item No. 1: To confirm and approve the Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Thursday the 10th January 2013 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051

The Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Thursday the 10th January 2013 at 11.00 a.m. at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai - 400 051 are confirmed and approved.



Item No.2(a): To review actions taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meeting including meeting held on 10th January,2013.

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on Thursday, the 10th January, 2013, the details of the same are as follows:

Meeting of 10 th Jan. 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti.	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on 16/1/2013.
Item No. 2: (a & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2012-13.	The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on 16/1/2013.
Item No. 3:	<p>Decide on the proposals received for approval of the fee structure for the courses started during AY 2012-13:</p> <p>a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.</p> <p>b) discrepancies were pointed out and are cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.</p> <p>c) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed to the Colleges/Institutes.</p> <p>d) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are not cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.</p> <p>e) To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.</p>	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & Notice Board on 16/1/2013.
Item No. 4:	<p>To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2012-13 :</p> <p>1) PGD/BDS : YMT Dental College & Hospital P.G. Institution, Navi Mumbai</p> <p>2) BHMSPG : Y.M.T. Homoeopathic Medical College, Kharghar, Navi Mumbai</p> <p>3) BPTH : DES College of Physiotherapy, Pune</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti in respect of Samiti are published on the website & Notice Board on 16/1/2013.</p> <p>Decision is conveyed to the respective colleges by a separate letter dated 21/1/2013.</p>
Item No. 5:	To consider and decide about the finalization of fee proposals of the Institutes/colleges those failed to submit proposals to Samiti for its consideration for AY 2012-13	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Samiti are published on the website & Notice Board on 16/1/2013.

Meeting of 10 th Jan. 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
<p>Item No. 6 (a)</p> <p>(b)</p> <p>(c)</p>	<p>Letter dated 26/12/2012 received from Police Inspector, Economic Offences wing, Amravati citing violation of Capitation Fees Act by Dr. Panjabrao Deshmukh Medical College, Amravati.</p> <p>Letter dated 6/12/2012 received from Bhalchandra School of Nursing, Pune citing non approval of INC for RGNM course for AY 2012-13.</p> <p>Letter dated 2/1/2013 received from Vidarbha Regional Private Nursing School and Colleges Management Association, Nagpur regarding approval of final fees for RGNM course AY 2012-13 of following institutes (Ref. WP No. as per decision of WP No. 3251/2012 In High Court of Judicature at Bombay, Nagpur Bench.)</p> <p>i) Sarvodaya Bhumiputra Bahuuddeshiya Vikas Mandal, Chandrapur</p> <p>ii) Tulja Bhavani Bahu-uddeshiya Sanstha's Shree Sai School of Nursing Umred, Nagpur</p> <p>iii) Sarvodaya Bhumiputra Bahuuddeshiya Vikas Mandal's Kasabai Nursing School, Wardha</p> <p>iv) Saraswati Bahuuddeshiya Shikshan Sanshta's Saraswati Institute of Nursing Sciences and Research, Amravati</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti in respect of Samiti are published on the website & Notice Board on 16/1/2013.</p> <p>Decision is conveyed to the respective colleges by a separate letter dated 21/1/2013.</p> <p>Decision of the Samiti in respect of Samiti are published on the website & Notice Board on 16/1/2013.</p> <p>Decision is conveyed to the respective colleges by a separate letter dated 21/1/2013.</p>
Item No.6:	To consider the report received from M/S.P.V.Page & Co.,Chartered Accountants regarding Internal Audit for A.Y.2007-08, 2008-09.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of firm is published on the website & Notice Board on 16/1/2013 . Decision is conveyed to the respective company by a separate letter dated 21/1/2013 .
Item No. 7 Item No. 7 (a)	Any other matter with the permission to the chair To discuss and decide in regarding purchase of Laptops/Notebook for the Hon'ble Members of the Samiti.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Hon'ble Member is published on the website & Notice Board on 16/1/2013 .

Samiti noted it.



Item No. 2(b): To review disposal of work – Present Scenario for Academic Year 2012-13.

- i) Chart showing No. of fees approval proposals received from the Institutes of Health Science Courses/Institutes for Academic Year 2012-13.

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2011-12)	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared (A.Y. 2012-13)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals				No. of Colleges who failed to submit proposals	Ad-hoc Fees (A.Y. 2012-13)
						Under Scrutinized	Deff.	calculate	Verified by C.A.		
1	MD/MS (PG)	12	11	11	0	0	0	0	0	1	Rs.496120/-
2	Medical/MBBS	11	11	11	0	0			0	0	Rs.330750/-
3	PG Dental	15	14	14	0	0			0	1	Rs.176400/-
4	BDS	22	21	20	0	0	1		0	1	Rs.148840/-
5	PG- Ayurved	12	12	12	0	0			0	0	Rs.99220/-
6	Ayurved	40	38	37	0	0	1		0	2	Rs.77180/-
7	PG. Homeopathic	14	12	12	0	0			0	2	Rs.66150/-
8	Homeopathic	45	40	40	0	0			0	5	Rs.44100/-
9	Physiotherapy	21	18	18	0	0			0	3	Rs.46300/-
10	MP-TH (PG.- Phisiotherapy)	8	7	7	0	0	0		0	1	Rs.60640/-
11	Occupational Therapy	2			0	0			0	2	Rs.38590/-
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	1			0	0			0	1	Rs.55120/-
13	PG - Unani	4			0	0			0	4	Rs.55120/-
14	Unani	6	3	1	2	0	2		0	3	Rs.46300/--
15	BASLP	2	1	1	0	0			0	1	Rs.49610/-
16	M.Sc.Nursing	7	7	7	0	0			0	0	Rs.55120/-
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	19	19	18	1	0	1		0	0	Rs.49610/-
18	B.Sc.Nursing	49	49	46	3	0	2	1	1	0	Rs.44100/-
19	RANM Nursing	388	388	99	289	252	28	29	29	0	Rs. 36750/-
20	RGNM Nursing	143	143	37	106	92	13	7	7	0	Rs. 36750/-
21	Dental Hygienist				0	0				0	Rs. 15750/-
22	Dental Mechanic				0	0				0	Rs.15750/-
	Total	821	794	391	403	344	48	37	37	27	

Samiti noted it.



- ii) Pendency of Revision of Applications for the month ending November 2012 for the Academic Year 2012-13.

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
1	MD/MS (PG)	0	0	0
2	Medical/MBBS	1	0	1
3	PG Dental	2	0	2
4	BDS	3	0	3
5	PG- Ayurved	0	0	0
6	Ayurved	0	0	0
7	PG. Homeopathic	1	0	1
8	Homeopathic	0	0	0
9	Physiotherapy	1	0	1
10	MP-TH (PG.- Physiotherapy)	0	0	0
11	Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
12	P.G. Occupational Therapy	0	0	0
13	PG - Unani	0	0	0
14	Unani	0	0	0
15	BASLP	0	0	0
16	M.Sc.Nursing	1	0	1
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	0	0	0
18	B.Sc.Nursing	1	0	1
19	RANM Nursing	0	0	0
20	RGNM Nursing	1	0	1
21	Dental Hygienist	0	0	0
22	Dental Mechanic	0	0	0
Total		11	0	11

Samiti noted it.

- iii) Pendency of Revision of Applications for the month ending November 2012 for the Academic Year 2011-12.

Sr. No.	Stream	No. of Revisions	No. of Revision decided	Pendency
1	R.A.N.M.	01	0	01

Samiti noted it.

Item No. 3: **To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2012-13:**

Item No. 3(a) : **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

and

Item No. 3(b) : **To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies were pointed out and are cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.**

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2012-13. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2012-13. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2012-13 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2012-13 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2nd year, 3rd year and 4th year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

B.Sc. Nursing

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	B.Sc.NS.	Jawahar Medical Foundation's Annasaheb Chudaman Patil , Dhule	44000	40000	50000

R.A.N.M.

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	RANM	Bharat Ratna Mother Teresa Nursing School, Selu, Parbhani	60000	70000	88208
2	RANM	Mungsaji Maharaj Nursing School, Darwha, Yavatmal	45000 (Collect Fees)	60000	75611
3	RANM	Mungsaji Maharaj Nursing School, Yavatmal	45000 (Collect Fees)	60000	72863
4	RANM	Shree Vinayakraobapu School of Nursing, Yavatmal	45000 (Collect Fees)	60000	75453
5	RANM	Kalyan Institute of Nursing Education, Rajura, Chandrapur	60000 (Collect Fees)	72000	98451
6	RANM	Binit Nursing Institute, Solapur	50000 (Collect Fees)	60000	77860
7	RANM	G.B.Patil School of Nursing, Udgir, Latur	50360	60000	69788
8	RANM	Smt Saraswati Nursing RANM School, Tondavli	40000	65000	111049
9	RANM	Aakar School of Nursing, Nagpur	-	70000	86071 (One Year)
10	RANM	VKMF's Kurundwad Institute of Nursing Education, Kurundwad, Kolhapur	35000	60000	85000
11	RANM	Nasik Medico Training's College of Nursing, Nashik	64660 (Collect Fees)	58140	61871
12	RANM	L.D.H.T. Nursing School, Sawad, Hingoli	33420	60000	70000
13	RANM	Dr. Dalvi Memorial Hospital & Research Centre Nursing Training School, Nagpur	33200	45000	45387 (One Year)
14	RANM	Shree Swami Samartha Nursing School Ner (P), Yavatmal	45000 (Collect Fees)	60000	72863
15	RANM	Vasundharabai Ghulkedkar Nursing School, Amravati	45000 (Collect Fees)	60000	89978

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
16	RANM	Dhanvantari Charitable Sanstha, Solapur	70000 (Collect Fees)	70000	91658
17	RANM	Tulshiramji Shebe School of Nursing, Pusad, Yavatmal	45000 (Collect Fees)	60000	76708
18	RANM	Sharda Nursing School , Khapa, Bhandara	55000	46100	70000
19	RANM	Bhakti Institute of Nursing, Pandharpur, Solapur	65000 (Collect Fees)	65000	65000
20	RANM	Godavari College of Nursing, Jalgaon	20000 (Collect Fees)	50000	62234
21	RANM	Suretech College of Nursing ,Nagpur	45000	25000	25702
22	RANM	Vasantrao Naik Institute of Nursing, Jalna	60000	65000	66237
23	RANM	Laxmanrao Umak Memorial Nursing School, Badnera, Amravati	44450	45760	52975
24	RANM	Hon.R.R.Patil Institute of Nursing Education, Sangli	57000	57280	61675 (1&1/2 year)
25	RANM	Florence School of Nursing, Gadhinglaj, Kolhapur	45000	53000	53004
26	RANM	Sai Nursing School, Malegaon, Nashik	45440	60000	96000
27	RANM	Nootan School of Nursing, Nandgaon, Raigad	60000	61760	68846
28	RANM	Florence's Nightingale Training College of Nursing, Sawangi, Wardha	55000	65000	72002

R.G.N.M.

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	RGNM	M.E.S.School of Nursing,Khed, Ratnagiri	35000	37000	39235
2	RGNM	Smt. Sumitrabai Thakare Training College of Nursing, Yavatmal	40000	45000	47015
3	RGNM	Chinguaai Institute of Nursing Education,Sangli	35000 (Adhoc)	37500	37500
4	RGNM	Godavari College of Nursing, Jalgaon	20000 (Collect Fees)	50000	59577
5	RGNM	Florences Nightingale Training College of Nursing, Sawangi, Wardha	55000	63000	65520
6	RGNM	Gururaj School of Nursing,Pune	35530	50000	76000 (RGNM) 75000 (RANM)

The College/Institute viz. Gururaj School of Nursing, Pune teaching R.A.N.M. course are before the Samiti for finalisation of fee for Academic Year 2012-13, but it is not possible to approve their fees for Academic Year 2012-13 as permission for 2012-13 course has been not granted by the Maharashtra Nursing Council, Mumbai.

Note : *R.A.N.M. course is of 1 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fee for 1 year can be charged wherever it is mentioned for 1 year collected fee.*

Note : *R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 3 years can be charged.*

Item No. 3(c): To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/Institutes.

Nil

Item No. 3(d): To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.

Office to scrutinize and place the proposals before the Samiti in due course.



Item No. 4(a): To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2012-13.

Item No. 4(1): PGD0003 – Y.M.T. Dental College and Hospital, P.G. Institution, Navi Mumbai

Samiti heard Dr. Kokate – Principal and Mr. J.R. Dagole – Chartered Accountant on behalf of the aforesaid College/Institute.

As per our resolution College/Institute has given notice to the Students/Parents and Dr. Sumal Raut and Dr. Reshma Sawla students are present.

This is in respect of Post Graduate Dental course started during the Academic Year 2012-13. The interim fee declared was Rs. 4,15,000/-. The Institute was collected it. The Institute has demanded Rs. 4,21,141/-, but the Samiti has finalized the fee of Rs. 4,08,769/-. The Institute has pointed out the error in disallowing certain expenditure incurred by it. It has accepted that some expenses are correctly rejected.

Considering all this it is now prayed that at least Rs. 4,15,000/- fee may be granted. The students have no objections for it. The Institute has given letter dated 7/2/2013 to that effect. We feel that it is quite reasonable. Hence we finalize the fee of Rs. 4,15,000/- for students who joined the Post Graduate Dental course during the Academic Year 2012-13. Office to take steps accordingly.

Item No. 4(2): BDS0003-YMT Dental College and Hospital, Navi Mumbai

Samiti heard Dr. Kokate – Principal and Mr. J.R. Dagole – Chartered Accountant on behalf of the aforesaid College/Institute.

As per our resolution College/Institute has given notice to the Students/Parents, but none is present on behalf of students/parents. Copy of notice is produced.

This is in respect of BDS course started during the Academic Year 2012-13. The interim fee declared was Rs. 2,48,900/-. The Institute has demanded the fee of Rs. 2,49,700/-. But the Samiti has finalized the fees of Rs. 2,47,200/- for the Academic Year 2012-13. The Institute has pointed out the certain expenditure has wrongly not allowed. There is some substance in this. The Institute has now prayed that at least Rs. 2,48,900/- may be granted as fees, The Institute has given letter dated 7/2/2013 to that effect. We feel that it is quite reasonable. Hence we finalize the fee of Rs. 2,48,900/- for students who joined the course of BDS during the Academic Year 2012-13. Office to take steps accordingly.



Item No. 4(3): BHMSPG00001-YMT Homoeopathic Medical College, Navi Mumbai

Samiti heard Dr. Kokate – Principal and Mr. J.R. Dagole – Chartered Accountant on behalf of the aforesaid College/Institute.

As per our resolution College/Institute has given notice to the Students/Parents, but none is present on behalf of students/parents. The copy of the notice is produced.

This is in respect of B.H.M.S. course starting during Academic Year 2012-13. The interim fee declared was Rs. 68,700/-. The Institute has demanded 68,900/-. We have finalized the fee of Rs. 64,950/- The Institute has pointed out that for Academic Year 2011-12 fee finalized by the Samiti is Rs. 68,700/-. It is also pointed out there was error in proposal in stating development fee. It has now prayed that the fee of Rs. 68,700/- at least be granted. The letter dated 7/2/2013 to effect is given. We feel that it is quite reasonable. Hence we finalize the fee of Rs. 68,700/- for students who joined the B.H.M.S. course during the Academic Year 2012-13. Office to take steps accordingly.

Item No. 4(4): DES College of Physiotherapy, Pune

Samiti heard Mr. D.A. Kulkarni, Life Member and Ms. Aparna Sadhale, Principal present on behalf of College/Institute

As per our resolution College/Institute has given notice to the Students/Parents, but none is present on behalf of students/parents. The copy of the notice is produced.

This is in respect of B.P.Th. course starting in Academic Year 2012-13. The fee approved for Academic Year 2011-12 of Rs. 72,000/-. The fee approved for Academic Year 2012-13 was Rs. 80,000/-. The Institute has originally demanded fee of Rs. 90,000/-. It has pointed out that the salary expenses of 17% ought not have deducted. There is some substance in it. The Institute has now given letter dated 7/2/2013 stating that the fee of Rs. 85,000/- may be declared. After deliberation, we feel that it is quite reasonable. Hence we approve the fee of Rs. 85,000/- for students who joined the B.P.Th. course during the Academic Year 2012-13. Office to take steps accordingly.

Item No. 4(b): RANM : Vishwastiya Nursing School, Niphad, Nashik

This revision was filed on 13/10/2012 for the course started in Academic Year 2011-12. The course is of 1 ½ years and the said course is already over. Therefore, this revision has become in fructuous. Hence dismissed.



Item No. 5: **To consider and decide on the letters received dated 17/12/2013 received from MVPS's Institute of Nursing Education, Nashik regarding to finalizing the fee structure for M.Sc. Nursing for Academic Year 2012-13.**

Considered the letter dated 17/12/2013 received from MVPS's Institute of Nursing Education, Nashik. Office to correct B.Sc./M.Sc. The fees already approved by the Samiti in its meeting held on 7/11/2012. Office to take steps.

Item No. 6: **To consider the letter dated 17/01/2013 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik demanding free Technical Education and Higher Education for Matang Students.**

Considered the letter dated 17/01/2013 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik.

It is in respect of granting in exemption in payment of fees for the students belonging to 'Matang' samaj. This does not lie within the purview of this Samiti and it is for State Government to take decision. Office to communicate.

Item No. 7: **To consider the report received from M/s. P.V. Page and Co., Chartered Accountants related to Internal Audit for Assessment Year 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12.**

To be considered in the next meeting.

Item No. 8: **Any other matter with the permission to the Chiar.**

Nil

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Wednesday the 27th February 2013 at 11.00 a.m.** in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date: 11-2-13


(P.S. PATANKAR)
CHAIRMAN