

Minutes of the meeting of the **Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the Chairmanship of **Justice P.S. Patankar (Retd.)** on **Tuesday, the 8<sup>th</sup> July 2013** at 11.30 a.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.

**Draft Minutes:-**

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Shri S.B. Bhagwat, CA : Member
2. Dr. (Mrs.) Snehalata Deshmukh : Member
3. Dr. A.S. Vyas : Member

Invitees:

Shri. Ananat B. Kulkarni Member Secretary and Add. Chief Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Govt. of Maharashtra couldn't remain present. Hence, leave of absence granted.

Shri P.E. Gaikwad, Office Secretary, Shikshan Shulka Samiti was present in the meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

The copies of the agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1:** **To confirm and approve the Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on Thursday the 13<sup>th</sup> June 2013 at Conference Hall, Office of the Samiti, 3rd floor, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Bandra (E), Mumbai 400 051.**

Minutes of the Meeting of Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) held on 13<sup>th</sup> June 2013 are confirmed and approved.

**Item No.2(a): To review actions taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meeting on 13<sup>th</sup> June, 2013.**

The action taken by the office on the decisions taken by the Samiti during its meeting held on 13<sup>th</sup> June, 2013, the details of the same are as follows:



<b>Meeting of 13<sup>th</sup> June 2013</b>	<b>Actionable Points</b>	<b>Action Taken by Office</b>
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 13 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 .	Minutes of the Samiti Published on the website of the Samiti on <b>14/6/2013</b>
Item No. 2: (a & b)	To appraise of the action taken by office and review of disposal of work for AY 2013-14.	The copy of said minutes is also put up on the Notice Board on <b>14/6/2013</b> .
Item No. 3(a):	decide on the proposals received for approval of the fee structure for the courses started during AY 2013-14: i) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies. ii. To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/ Institutes. iii. To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & Notice Board on <b>14/6/2013</b> .
Item No. 3(b):	To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2012- 13: i) To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies were pointed out and are cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.	
Item No. 4	To consider and decide the Review Application received from following colleges for fixation of fees for AY 2012-13	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & Notice Board on <b>14/6/2013</b> .  Decision is conveyed to the respective colleges by a separate letter dated <b>17/6/2013</b> .
Item No. 5	To Consider and decide the Letter dated 6/06/2013 received from Sharad Jaysingh Patil, in respect of Siddhakala Ayurvedic College , Sangmner regarding refund of Admission fees.	Decision of the Samiti in respect of Colleges are published on the website & Notice Board on <b>14/6/2013</b> .  Decision is conveyed to the respective person by a separate letter dated <b>17/6/2013</b> .

The Samiti noted it.



**Item No.2(b): To review disposal of work – present Scenario for Academic Year 2013- 14.**

Chart Showing No. of fees approval proposals received from the Institutes of Medical Courses for Academic Year 2013-14.

**Monthly Chart of pendency of fee approval proposals month of 29 JUNE 13**

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2012-13)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 29June 13	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared ( A.Y. 2013-14)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			No. of Colleges who failed to submit proposals	Adhoc Fees (A. Y. 2013-14)
							Under Scrutinized	Def.	Verified by C.A.		
1	MD/MS (PG)	12	7	4		4	2		2	8	Rs.520930/
2	Medical/MBBS	11	10	5		5	2		3	6	Rs.353900/
3	PG Dental	15	8	4		4	1	1	2	11	Rs.185220/
4	BDS	22	14	11		11	7		4	11	Rs.159260/
5	PG- Ayurved	12	8	7		7	6		1	5	Rs.104180/
6	Ayurved	40	22	18		18	16	1	1	22	Rs.82580/-
7	PG. Homeopathic	14	7	2		2	2			12	Rs.69460/-
8	Homeopathic	45	29	23		23	23			22	Rs.47190/-
9	Physiotherapy	21	17	13		13	11		2	8	Rs.49540/-
10	MP-TH (PG.- Physiotherapy)	8	2	2		2	2			6	Rs.63670/-
11	Occupational Therapy	2	0	0		0	0			2	Rs.41290/-
12	P.G.Occupational Therapy	1	0	0		0	0			1	Rs.57880/-
13	PG - Unani	4	0	0		0	0			4	Rs.57880/-
14	Unani	6	2	2		2	2			4	Rs.49540/-
15	BASLP	2	0	0		0	0			2	Rs.53080/-
16	M.Sc.Nursing	7	7	5	1	4	3		1	2	Rs.57880/-
17	P.B.B.Sc. Nursing	19	15	9	1	8	6		2	10	Rs.53080/-

No.	Streams	No Of expected Colleges (A.Y.2012-13)	Online Proposal Confirmed upto 29 June 13	No. of Proposals received	No of Proposals Final Fees declared ( A.Y. 2013-14)	Total Pendency Proposals	No. of Pending Proposals			No. of Colleges who filed to submit proposals	Adhoc Fees (A.Y. 2013-14)
							Under Scrutinized	Def.	Verified by C.A.		
18	B.Sc.Nursing	51	44	34	2	32	27		5	17	Rs.47190/-
20	DMLT(After B.Sc.)	1	0	0		0	0			1	Rs.50000/-
21	RANM Nursing	430	193	149	4	145	132	2	11	281	Rs.39320/-
22	RGNM Nursing	164	84	62	1	61	58	1	2	102	Rs.39320/-
23	Dental Hygienist						0				Rs.16850/-
24	Dental Mechanic						0				Rs.16850/-
	<b>Total</b>	<b>887</b>	<b>469</b>	<b>350</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>341</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>36</b>	<b>537</b>	
							341				

The Samiti noted it.

**Item No. 3(a) :** To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2013-14:

**Item No. 3(a)(i) :** To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.

The Samiti considered the proposals of the following Colleges/Institutes for finalization of fee structure for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14. After deliberations, The Samiti decides to approve the final fee structure of the following Colleges/Institutes for the students who joined the course started during Academic Year 2013-14, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Figures are arrived at after considering the calculations drawn in the worksheet – calculation sheets of the respective colleges/institutes prepared by a Chartered Accountant. The students admitted in Academic Year 2013-14 and there after continuing their studies will pay an enhanced fee of 5% each successive year as per the norms for 2013-14 till completion of the course. For example if the fee approved is Rs. 1,00,000/- then 2<sup>nd</sup> year, 3<sup>rd</sup> year and 4<sup>th</sup> year's student of the Health Science Colleges will be Rs. 1,05,000/-. (Assuming course is of 4 years). Worksheet – Calculation sheets are available in the office.

**Post Graduate Medical (MD/MS)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Remarks
1	MBBS PG 0010	Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Narhe, Pune	Finalization Deferred



**Medical (M.B.B.S)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	MBBS0008	Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Latur MBBS/ MD/MS	355000	<b>400000</b> <b>*14774</b>	425578
2	MBBS0010	Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Narhe, Pune	Finalization Deferred		
3	MBBS0012	Ashwini Rural Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Solapur	<b>330750FY</b> <b>500000SY</b> <b>onwards</b>	<b>500000</b>	857787

**Post Graduate Dental (MDS)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	BDSPG0015	Sinhgad Dental College, Narhe, Pune	<b>176400FY</b> <b>400000SY</b> <b>onwards</b>	<b>400000</b>	450000
2	BDSPG0018	Late Shri Yashwantrao Chavan Memorial Medical and Rural Development Foundation's Dental College P.G. Course, Ahmednagar	<b>176400FY</b> <b>400000SY</b> <b>onwards</b>	<b>400000</b>	1000000

**Dental (BDS)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	BDS0015	Sinhgad Dental College, Narhe, Pune	320000	<b>350000</b>	350000
2	BDS0018	Saraswati Dhanwantri Dental College, Parbhani	243550	<b>300000</b>	312979

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
3	BDS0019	Late Shri Yashwantrao Chavan Memorial Medical and Rural Development Foundation's Dental College, Ahmednagar	250000	<b>300000</b>	310000
4	BDS	Maharashtra Institute of Dental Science & Research Latur.	138600	<b>150000</b> <b>*1607</b>	162869

**Post Graduate Ayurved (MD - Ayurved)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	BAMS PG0011	Loknete Rajarambapu Patil Ayurvedic Medical College, Hospital, Post Graduate Institute and Research Centre, Islampur	220000	<b>250000</b>	263024

**Ayurved (BAMS)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	BAMS0022	Loknete Rajarambapu Patil Ayurvedic Medical College, Hospital, Post Graduate Institute and Research Centre, Islampur	200000	<b>230000</b>	253169



**Physiotherapy (B.P.Th.)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	PT0007	Maharashtra Institute of Physiotherapy, Latur	65000	<b>73000</b> *2017	73012
2	PT0016	Smt. Kashibai Navale College of Physiotherapy, Narhe, Pune	75000	<b>83000</b>	85000

**Post Graduate Nursing (M.Sc. Nursing)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	MSCN0003	Sinhgad Nursing College, Narhe, Pune	75000	<b>83000</b>	92640

**B.Sc. Nursing**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	BSCN0001	Holy Spirit Institute of Nursing Education, Mumbai	76500	76500	90000
2	BSCN0010	Sinhgad Nursing College, Narhe, Pune	78000	<b>75000</b>	75521
3	BSCN0033	Fortis Institute of Nursing , Bhandup	70000	<b>77000</b>	84200
4	BSCN0017	Maharashtra Nursing School , Chakur, Latur	45000	<b>46800</b> *736	46851
5	BSCN0037	K.K. Wagh College of Nursing, Nashik	39000	<b>39000</b>	50000



**Post Basic Nursing (P.B.Sc. Nursing)**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	PBBSC 0010	Sinhgad Nursing College, Narhe, Pune	50445	<b>49500</b>	49578
2	PBSCN 0033	Fortis Institute of Nursing , Bhandup	90000	<b>100000</b>	116700

**R.A.N.M.**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	RANM	Loknete Rajarmbapu Patil Training College, Walwa, Sangli	36750	<b>40000</b>	45966
2	RANM	Matsyodari Nursing School, Ambad Jalana	70000	<b>70000</b>	110239
3	RANM	Jeevan Rekha School of Nursing, Yavatmal	50000	<b>51000</b>	82000
4	RANM	Yash Institute of Nursing, Yavatmal	70000	<b>62000</b>	<b>87000</b>
5	RANM	Global Nursing School, Nanded - 431708	35000	<b>45000</b>	79661
6	RANM	Smt. Gunmala Jain Nursing Institute, Gondia	33370	<b>45000</b>	56250
7	RANM	Vasantrao Naik Institute of Nursing, Jalna	65000	<b>68000</b>	69132
8	RANM & RGNM	Ashwini Institute of Nursing Education, Solapur - 413003	49430	<b>55000</b>	64545
9	RANM & RGNM	Maharashtra Nursing School , Chakur, Latur	60000	<b>64000 *1016</b>	64622
10	RANM	Yashwant Nursing School, Ashti, Beed	58000	<b>65000</b>	77454
11	RANM	Dharti School of Nursing, Taroda Khurd, Beed	40000	<b>50000</b>	119954



**R.G.N.M.**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2013-14	Institute Demands
1	RGNM	Loknete Rajarmbapu Patil Training College, Walwa, Sangli	36750	<b>45000</b>	46066
2	RGNM	Vasantrao Naik Institute of Nursing School, Jalana	55000	<b>58000</b>	58029

**Note:** R.A.N.M. course is of 1 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fee for 1 year can be charged wherever it is mentioned for 1 year collected fee.

**Note:** R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 3 years can be charged.

**Note:** R.A.N.M. and R.G.N.M. courses the fee approved, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities.

**Item No. 3(a)(ii): To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies are yet to be pointed out to the Colleges/ Institutes.**

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Deficiency
1	RGNM0064	Renuka Nursing School, Vida, Tal-Kau, Beed	1) In Income and Expenditure Account details of Income not given. 2) Affidavit incomplete- Collected fee not shown in affidavit.
2	BAMS0006	Hanuman Shikshan Prasarak Mandal, Ayurvedica Medical College, Peth Vadgaon, Hatkangale, Kolhapur	From E Incomplete
3	RANM	Smt. Kamalaben Patel Institute of Nursing Education, Kumbhari, Solapur	1) In Income and Expenditure Account bifurcation not given.
4	RANM	Yash Institute of Nursing & Paramedical Science, Indapur, Pune	1) Computation Form not submitted.

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Deficiency
		413106	
5	RANM	Bhakti Institute of Nursing, Pandhpur, Solapur	1) Computation Form not submitted.

The fee of the above Colleges/ Institutes are to be approved after the deficiencies are cleared. Office to communicate the deficiencies which are to be cleared within a period of 15 days of receipt of the letter.

- iii) **To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.**

Office to scrutinize and place the proposals before the Samiti in due course.

**Item No. 3(b): To decide on the proposals received for approval of fees structure for the courses started during Academic Year 2012-13:**

**Item No. 3(b)(i): To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies were pointed out and are cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.**

#### RGNM

Sr. no.	Code No.	Name of the Institute	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2011-12	Final Fees for course starting from AY 2012-13	Institute Demands
1	RGNM	Sai Care Nursing School, Nashik	<b>35000FY</b> <b>50000SY</b> <b>onwards</b>	<b>50000</b>	71536

**Note:** R.G.N.M. course is of 3 ½ years and hence for the last six months half of the fees for 3 years can be charged.

**Note:** R.A.N.M. and R.G.N.M. courses the fee approved, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities.

**Item No. 3(b)(ii) : To consider and decide on proposals where discrepancies were pointed out and are not cleared by the Colleges/Institutes.**

<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Code</b>	<b>Name of the Institute</b>
1	B.Sc. & P.B.Bsc.	Dr.Panjabrao Deshmukh Nursing Institute,Amravati
2	RANM & RGNM	Aparna Institute of Nursing Education, Karad, Satara
3	RANM	Mother Teresa Nursing School RGNM,Nanded
4	RANM	Global Health Care Institute School of Nursing, Nashik
5	RANM	Jawalge Nursing School, Latur
6	RANM	Jay Hind Nursing School,Hingoli
7	RANM	Jeevan Jyot Nursing College , Osmanabad
8	RANM	Madhav ANM School, Parbhani
9	RANM	Pad.Dr.Vasantdada Patil Shikshan Sanstha NS. School,Koregaon, Latur
10	RANM	Patil Deshmukh Gramin Vikas Pratishthan,Kotul, Akole, Ahmednagar
11	RANM	Radhabai Bahekar Nursing School,Gondia
12	RANM	Renuka Nursing School,Kaij,Beed
13	RANM	Sant Namdev ANM School of Nursing,Gangakhed, Parbhani
14	RANM	Sant Rambhau ANM School,Ahmedpur,Latur
15	RANM	Susain ANM Nursing School, Osmanabad
16	RANM	W.F.P.M. Hospital School of Nursing, Wai, Satara
17	RGNM	Dhanwantri Shikshan Samaj Pratishthan,Wadgaon, Pune
18	RANM & RGNM	Dr.Panjabrao Deshmukh Nursing Institute,Amravati
19	RGNM	Sahyadri Seva Sanstha, Samruddhi School of Nursing,Malegaon, Nashik
20	RGNM	Vasantprabha School of Nursing, Buldana
21	RGNM	W.F.P.M. Hospital School of Nursing, Wai, Satara
22	RANM & RGNM	Shree Anant Charitable Trust's Kasal Institute of Nursing, Kudal



Sr. No.	Code	Name of the Institute
23	RANM & RGNM	Shirodkar Hospital Trust's Institute of Nursing Education & Paramedical Sciences, Dombivali

Inspite of giving notices, pointing out various deficiencies, they are not cleared. Hence the Institute can charge the fee payable in similar government institute as per our resolution passed on 10/1/2013 and if there is no such institute run by the government then Ad-hoc fees declared by the Samiti are to be changed which are as below.

In case where the Government has not fixed the fee then the Institutes can only charge the Ad-hoc fee fixed by the Shikshan Shulka Samiti, details of which are as under:-

Sr. No	Courses	Total Fee
1.	B.Sc. & P.B.Bsc	6600/-
2.	R.A.N.M./R.G.N.M.	36,750/-

**Item No. 4: To consider the letter received from following colleges.**

**Item No. 4(a): Letter dated 11/05/2013 received from Virar Homoeopathic Medical College in respect of fees of those students who are not allowed to appear for exam, in view of their unsatisfactory attendance.**

Considered the letter dated 1/05/2013 received from Principal of Konkan Education & Medical Trust's . According to the Maharashtra University of Health Sciences , if a student has not attended and if his attendance is below 75 % he is not allowed to fill up the form and appear for the exam. As per the rules the student has to fulfill criteria of 70% for theory & 75% for practical as prescribed by the University and hence will have to pay fee accordingly. Office to communicate.

**Item No. 4(b): Letter dated 13/6/2013 received from Bombay Hospital Trust, informing that the fee was charged for 2012-13 was Rs. 1,50,000/- p.a.**

Considered the letter dated 13/06/2013 received from Hon. Director, Medical, Education & Research from Bombay Hospital Trust regarding M.D./M.S./D.M & M.Ch courses Maximum fee chargeable was as approved by the Samiti was Rs. 3,21,000/- This means that no institute can charge more than the approved fee, but it is always open to charge less than that. In this case it is

stated that the institute has only charged Rs. 1,50,000/-. We welcome the gesture of the Institute. Office to communicate.

**Item No. 4(c): Letter dated 28/06/2013 received from students of ACPM Medical college, Dhule regarding display of final fees for academic year 2012-13.**

Considered the letter dated 28/06/2013 received from students of the Institute copy of the letter to be sent by the institute by the office seeking clarification about it. It is made clear that the institute had not submitted the proposal for approval of fees for Post Graduate Medical courses for 2012-13.

**Item No. 5: Any other matter with the permission of the Chair.**

**Item No. 5(a):** The time to file proposal is extended by 1 month i.e. upto 31/08/2013 subject to payment of Rs. 10,000/- per proposal /per course as late fee.

**Item No. 5(b):** Considered the letter dated 22/6/2013 from Dr. Principal Vishwanath D. Karad, Executive President and Managing Trustee Maeer's Maharashtra Institute of Technology Group of Institutions, Pune, India.

This subject does not fall within the purview of the Samiti and it is for the State Government to provide the 3 tier system as contemplated by the said letter.

- 1) Students from Maharashtra.
- 2) Students from outside Maharashtra or from Management Quota.
- 3) NRI students .

Such three tier fee structure can only be decided by the State Government, by making law (enactment). It can provide for the ratio in which fee shall be payable by the students of those 3 tiers. Office to communicate.

The next meeting of the Shikshan Shulka Samiti (Medical Education) would be held on **Tuesday the 6<sup>th</sup> August 2013** at 11:00 a.m. in the Meeting Hall, Office of the Samiti at 305, Government Polytechnic Building, 49, Kherwadi, Ali Yawar Jung Marg, Bandra (E) Mumbai 400 051.

Date:

11-7-13

  
(P.S. PATANKAR)  
CHAIRMAN